

# BOF Effectiveness Monitoring Committee Meeting Notes

March 22, 2018

## Natural Resources Building Sacramento, California

**1. Participants (14):** Members--Dr. Russ Henly (Co-Chair), Sue Husari (Co-Chair), Sal Chinnici, Tom Engstrom, Dr. Stacy Drury, Matt House, Clarence Hostler, Jim Burke, Mandy Culpepper, Bill Short, and Justin LaNier.

Staff--Eliana Camargo, Dave Fowler, and Pete Cafferata.

Participants--Steve Baumgartner.

**Webinar participants (4):** George Gentry, Richard Gienger, Eric Hedge, and John Meurer.

### **2. Report by the Co-Chairs**

- Sue Husari reported that the Board of Forestry and Fire Protection (BOF) will have an Exemption-Emergency (EX-EM) Notice Workshop on April 10, 2018 in Sacramento. The workshop will include background information on the different types of emergency and exemption notices, when they were created, their intent, and possible overlap. There will be discussion on the EX-EM notice monitoring report that is due from BOF and CAL FIRE to the Legislature in December 2018 (see [Public Resources Code § 4589](#)).
- Russ Henly reported on the following topics:
  - The California Forest Carbon Plan is currently at the Governor's office waiting public release. The hope is that a final version will be available to the public in early April.
  - AB 1492 update:
    - We are close to receiving the LiDAR data covering approximately 1200 mi<sup>2</sup> in Mendocino County from the USGS.
    - The Campbell Creek pilot project will use the LiDAR data when it is available. Also, (1) the data that were produced from the three track analysis for Smith Creek were synthesized using a GIS overlay process, (2) the Scope of Work group met to refine work product expectations, and (3) Natural Resources Agency will soon be hiring a retired annuitant to expand THP review in the Campbell Creek planning watershed for documenting cumulative effects assessment methods and data and for identifying restoration opportunities.

### **3. Updates on Contracting for Projects Approved by the EMC**

- **EMC-2015-001 (Class II-Large Monitoring)**: Pete Cafferata stated that he and Drew Coe participated in a conference call with Oregon State University's Dr. Kevin Bladon, Dr. Catalina Segura, and MS student Adam Pate on March 21<sup>st</sup> to assist with selection of Class II large watercourses for the regional scale study to assess the effectiveness of rule criteria for identifying Class II watercourses susceptible to thermal loading. The field work will occur this summer. Preliminary "clusters of Class II-L watercourses" have been identified in specific areas in Humboldt County, Mendocino County-Jackson Demonstration State Forest, Siskiyou County, Shasta County-LaTour Demonstration State Forest, Humboldt-Trinity counties, Trinity County, and Butte County (835 Class II-L watercourses in total). Site selection factors included aspect, geomorphic province, climate (temperature and precipitation), and ease of access/cluster factor. The objective is to

narrow this list down to approximately 100 sites based on additional information, such as landownership—including willingness for collaboration and access. CAL FIRE staff provided Mr. Pate with an up-to-date list of large non-federal forest landowners in California, approximate ownership size, and appropriate contacts on March 22<sup>nd</sup>.

- **EMC-2015-002 [Forest Practice Rules Implementation and Effectiveness Monitoring (FORPRIEM) ver. 2.0.] and EMC-2015-004 (Effectiveness of Road Rules in Reducing Hydrologic Connectivity and Significant Sediment Discharge)—Statistical Consultation:** Pete Cafferata reported that Dr. Ashley Steel, US Forest Service Pacific Northwest Research Station (PNW) and an EMC-funded statistical consultant, informed him that she and Pat Cunningham should be able to have a draft report, including using rock strength data for stratifying plan erosion risk, by April 3<sup>rd</sup>.
- **EMC-2017-001 (UC Davis Caspar Creek Nutrient Study):** Pete Cafferata stated that Dr. Helen Dahlke, MS student Seanna McLaughlin, and Dr. Randy Dahlgren, UC Davis, will shortly send an updated final version of the progress report prepared for the Save the Redwoods League documenting baseline nutrient data collected for the four sub-watersheds being studied in the South Fork Caspar Creek watershed. Ms. McLaughlin has installed an additional ISCO autosampler and funnel to collect rainwater in the South Fork Caspar Creek watershed.
- **EMC-2017-009: Effectiveness of Class II Watercourse and Lake Protection Zone (WLPZ) Forest Practice Rules (FPRs) at Maintaining or Restoring Canopy Closure, Stream Water Temperature, and Primary Productivity:** Matt House reported that he is continuing work on moving this project proposal forward. Green Diamond Resource Company (GDRCo) will host the study, testing both FPRs and their aquatic Habitat Conservation Plan prescriptions. Considerable logistical matters remain to be agreed upon, including support for this comprehensive project from the federal agencies. Mr. House and Drew Coe will work with project collaborators to develop a more complete project proposal in the coming months, so that a full project proposal is ready for consideration by the EMC by the start of new fiscal year.
- **EMC-2017-006: Tradeoffs Between Riparian Buffers, Fire, and Regeneration:** Eliana Camargo announced that the contract for this project submitted by Dr. Rob York, UC Berkeley, has been sent to CAL FIRE's Business Services Office.
- **EMC-2017-007: The Life Cycle of Dead Trees and Implications for Management:** Eliana Camargo announced that the contract for this project submitted by Dr. John Battles, UC Berkeley, has also been sent to CAL FIRE's Business Services Office.
- **EMC-2016-003: Repeat LiDAR Surveys to Detect Landslides:** Eliana Camargo reported that the contract for this project has not been sent to the Business Services Office. CGS staff have obtained a cost figure of \$534/mi<sup>2</sup> plus an administrative fee from the USGS. It may be possible to obtain 3D Elevation Program (3DEP) grant funding (<https://nationalmap.gov/3DEP/>), which would allow 15-20% more acreage to be covered in the Highway 50 area of the central Sierra Nevada. Initial grant awards will be made in October, so it is advantageous to wait and determine if this project qualifies. A draft scope of work has been provided to the USGS for their review. It is anticipated that the LiDAR flight will occur in the spring or summer of 2019, when snow cover has melted.
- **EMC-2017-004: Monitoring Class III Watercourses:** No contract is required; only equipment will be purchased with EMC funding.
- **EMC-2017-012: Bat Study on Demonstration State Forests:** No contract is required; only equipment will be purchased with EMC funding.

#### **4. Discussion of Projects Ranked by the EMC and EMC Recommendations for Funding**

- **EMC-2017-010: Meadow Restoration:** Co-Chair Henly informed the EMC that we learned after the February EMC meeting that Dr. Chris Surfleet, Cal Poly SLO, could not make the available two-year funding period work for his meadow restoration project with Collins Pine Company. Therefore, \$108,986 allocated by the EMC for this project at the last EMC meeting is now available for reallocation.
- Co-Chair Husari moved to recommend that the EMC allocate \$108,968 to **EMC-2017-008: FPRs to Minimize Fir Mortality from Root Diseases** if it can be completed in two years; if not, the EMC will recommend allocating \$108,986 to fund a second LiDAR collection by the USGS. Member Culpepper seconded the motion. The relative merits of the LiDAR data currently available for Mendocino County for review were discussed and Member House suggested it may be more beneficial to improve the quality of the LiDAR data rather than expand the scope of the project. A friendly amendment was offered by Member House to state that the LiDAR funding would be used to either expand the project footprint or increase the quality of the data. This amendment was accepted by both Co-Chair Husari and Member Culpepper.

<b>Roll Call</b>	<b><u>AYE</u></b>	<b><u>NO</u></b>	<b><u>ABSTAIN</u></b>	<b><u>ABSENT</u></b>
<b>Henly</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>Husari</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>Drury</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>Culpepper</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>Coe</b>				<b>X</b>
<b>LaNier</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>Hostler</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>Short</b>			<b>X</b>	
<b>Burke</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>Giusti</b>				<b>X</b>
<b>Engstrom</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>House</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>Chinnici</b>	<b>X</b>			
<b>O'Connor</b>				<b>X</b>

**The motion carried with one abstention and three members absent.**

#### **5. EMC Discussion of Possible Update to EMC Project Review Process**

Co-Chair Husari reported that the EMC Project Review Subcommittee, which includes Member Giusti, has not met yet. Eliana Camargo did, however, produce draft templates for EMC Concept Proposals and Requests for Funding to help improve the project review process. Comments from the EMC included:

- Add “project title” to both the Concept Proposal and the Request for Funding templates.
- Add section titles to the Concept Proposal template so that project submitters are aware of what is required (use past proposals for examples of what to include).

- Generate a third template so that there are an Initial Concept Proposal (short), Full Project Proposal (detailed, e.g., 5-10 pages), and Request for Funding.
- In the Concept Proposal template, include checkboxes for an estimate of funding being requested (e.g., <\$10,000, \$10,000 to \$50,000, \$50,000-\$100,000, etc.).
- In the Request for Funding template, make it clear that (1) funding is only available for two years, (2) the maximum acceptable overhead rate is 25 percent, and (3) a narrative description should be included indicating if matching funds are available.

**Eliana Camargo will work on improving the two existing templates and generate a third template for a Full Project Proposal prior to the next EMC meeting.**

Additionally, the current version of the “Request for Effectiveness Monitoring Project Proposals” document was provided to the EMC for review:

[http://www.bof.fire.ca.gov/board\\_committees/effectiveness\\_monitoring\\_committee/pdfs/request\\_for\\_emc\\_proposals\\_august\\_2017.pdf](http://www.bof.fire.ca.gov/board_committees/effectiveness_monitoring_committee/pdfs/request_for_emc_proposals_august_2017.pdf). Co-Chair Henly requested that the EMC provide edits to the Word document in track changes by April 18<sup>th</sup>, sending them to Eliana Camargo (one week before the April 25<sup>th</sup> meeting). EMC staff will begin the editing process in track changes prior to sending it to the EMC for their additional edits.

**6. Public Forum** – No public comments.

### **7. Future EMC Meeting Dates**

**The next EMC meeting will be held on April 25<sup>th</sup> in Ukiah at the UC Cooperative Extension office.**

Board staff will send out a Doodle poll for the June meeting, providing dates between June 15<sup>th</sup> and 25<sup>th</sup>. Member Chinnici requested that EMC staff consider scheduling a summer field meeting to an EMC project site, similar to the field meeting held at the Caspar Creek Experimental Watershed in 2017.

### **8. Announcements**

Pete Cafferata announced that he and Drew Coe have begun to develop responses to BOF Member Mike Miles’ nine questions submitted to the EMC regarding the necessity and benefits of Class II-large Forest Practice Rule requirements. **CAL FIRE Watershed Protection Program staff will generate a complete draft response for EMC review regarding which questions can be addressed from the existing literature and which require new research. Upon approval, this response will be provided to Member Miles to submit to the Board’s Forest Practice Committee.**

The **36<sup>th</sup> Annual Salmonid Restoration Conference** will be held in Fortuna on April 11-14, 2018. See: <https://www.calsalmon.org/conferences/36th-annual-salmonid-restoration-conference>

A UCCE **Redwood Region Forest Management and Market Trends Workshop** will be held on April 4<sup>th</sup>, 9:00-5:00, at the Agricultural Center, Eureka (cost \$20). <http://cehumboldt.ucanr.edu/>

An additional UCCE workshop is also scheduled:

**Understanding the New Oak Woodland Restoration Permits** on March 27<sup>th</sup>, 9:00-4:00 (location TBD—either Eureka or Bridgeville). Cost--\$20. <http://cehumboldt.ucanr.edu/>

The Western Section of the Wildlife Society is holding a **Foothill Yellow-Legged Frog Ecology, Management, and Regulation Workshop** on May 31<sup>st</sup> to June 3<sup>rd</sup> at Humboldt State University (27 slots available). See: [https://www.wildlifeprofessional.org/western/fylf2018\\_reg.php](https://www.wildlifeprofessional.org/western/fylf2018_reg.php)

The Board of Forestry and Fire Protection meeting being held in Santa Rosa on May 8-10 will include a field trip to view multiple aspects of the October North Bay wildfires.

California Department of Fish and Wildlife staff changes:

Mandy Culpepper announced that Isabel Baer has been appointed to the Timberland Conservation and Native Plant Programs Statewide Coordinator position (formerly held by Bill Condon).

Also, Angela Moran's Environmental Scientist (ES) position in Sacramento is currently open (closes March 30<sup>th</sup>).

California Natural Resources Agency position:

Co-Chair Henly announced that a new Senior Environmental Scientist (Specialist) position will be posted soon on the state Cal Careers website: <https://www.calcareers.ca.gov/>. This position will provide assistance to Dr. Henly, Assistant Secretary of Forest Resources Management.